

Rolf H. Weber · Mira Burri

# Classification of Services in the Digital Economy



 Springer

The Springer logo, which consists of a stylized white horse head (resembling a chess knight) facing right, positioned to the left of the word 'Springer' in a white serif font.

# Classification of Services in the Digital Economy



Rolf H. Weber • Mira Burri

# Classification of Services in the Digital Economy

 Springer

Professor Dr. Rolf H. Weber  
Faculty of Law  
University of Zurich  
Zurich  
Switzerland

Dr. iur. Mira Burri  
World Trade Institute  
University of Bern  
Bern  
Switzerland

ISBN 978-3-642-31634-0      ISBN 978-3-642-31635-7 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-3-642-31635-7  
Springer Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012947924

Copyright © Schulthess Juristische Medien AG, Zurich – Basel – Geneva 2012  
ISBN 978-3-7255-6591-7  
[www.schulthess.com](http://www.schulthess.com)

Published by Springer-Verlag GmbH Berlin Heidelberg 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only with permission of the copyright holder.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

## Preface

The classification of services in the digital economy proves critical for doing business, but it appears to be a particularly complex regulatory matter, which bears upon a manifold set of issues. In the context of the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), when the services classification scheme was drafted in the early 1990s, convergence processes had not unfolded yet and the Internet was still in its infancy and not a reality in daily life. Therefore, policy makers are now struggling with the problem of regulating trade in electronic services and are in search of a future-oriented solution for classifying them in multilateral and preferential trade agreements.

In late fall 2011, the authors of this study have been mandated by the European Union, Delegation to Vietnam, in the context of the Multilateral Trade Assistance Project 3 (MUTRAP 3) to work out a report clarifying the classification of services in the information/digital economy and to assess the impact of any decision regarding the classifications on the domestic and external relations policy of Vietnam, as well as to discuss the relevant issues with local experts during three site visits (done by WEBER). The efforts in writing the respective report have shown that further research is highly needed in the field of classifications in general and of digital services classification in particular. Therefore, the authors have come to the conclusion that a publication of the study in a slightly amended version would be beneficial to a broader audience and might contribute to the ongoing debate on these thorny regulatory issues.

The authors would like to thank the local experts in Hanoi, the Vietnam delegation of the EU in Hanoi, and the whole MUTRAP team as well as MLaw and Dipl.-Kfm Rainer Baisch (University of Zurich) for the fruitful co-operation. Any comments and suggestions would be appreciated.

April 2012

ROLF H. WEBER  
MIRA BURRI



# Contents

<b>Preface</b> .....	V
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	XI
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	XVII
<b>Figures and tables</b> .....	XIX
<b>Chapter I:</b>	
<b>IT services, telecommunications and new media in a converging era</b> .....	1
<b>1. Overview of services in the information economy</b> .....	2
<b>2. Overview of the WTO legal framework</b> .....	3
2.1 Notion of “services” .....	3
2.2 Modes of services supply .....	5
2.3 Disciplines .....	6
2.4 General limitations of liberalization .....	8
a) Domestic regulation .....	8
b) Exceptions .....	9
2.5 Preferential trade agreements .....	10
<b>3. Challenges for policy makers/regulators and trade negotiators</b> .....	13
3.1 Outdated classifications .....	13
3.2 Teleological interpretation of classification terms .....	14
3.3 Likeness aspects .....	15
3.4 Interim conclusion .....	16
<b>Chapter II:</b>	
<b>Overview of services classifications and the role of services classifications</b> .....	17
<b>1. Available classification regimes</b> .....	17
1.1 W/120 .....	17
1.2 CPC .....	17
1.3 OECD .....	21
1.4 MSITS .....	22
1.5 EBOPS .....	23
1.6 BPM6 .....	24
1.7 SNA .....	25
1.8 ISIC .....	26
1.9 Interim assessment .....	29



<b>2. Definition of service, supply of service, service suppliers, service consumer, services classification</b> .....	29
2.1 Service .....	29
2.2 Supply of service .....	33
2.3 Service suppliers .....	36
2.4 Service consumer .....	36
2.5 Services classification .....	36
2.6 Digital products .....	37
<b>3. WTO classifications as foundation and later development of other classifications</b> .....	38
3.1 Sectoral Classification List (W/120) .....	38
3.2 Central Product Classification (CPC) .....	38
3.3 Classifications in new PTAs .....	38
3.4 Other classifications .....	40
<b>4. Methodology for services classification from different points of view</b> .....	43
4.1 Basic principles of methodology .....	43
4.2 Classification for statistical and market/industry planning purposes .....	45
4.3 Policy- and rulemaking .....	46
4.4 Trade in services negotiations .....	49
<b>Chapter III:</b>	
<b>ICT services classification</b> .....	51
<b>1. Computer and communications services in general</b> .....	51
<b>2. IT (computer-related) services classification</b> .....	54
2.1 Factual background .....	54
2.2 Ongoing discussions .....	55
2.3 Possible alternatives in the era of technological convergence .....	57
2.4 Interim assessment .....	60
<b>3. Telecommunications services classification</b> .....	61
3.1 Legal framework .....	61
a) Annex on Telecommunications .....	61
b) Agreement on Basic Telecommunications .....	64
c) The Reference Paper .....	65
3.2 Particular characteristics of telecommunications services classification	67
3.3 Outdated telecommunications services classification .....	73
a) Basic versus value-added telecommunications services .....	73
b) Blurring of horizontal sectoral boundaries .....	74
c) Technological neutrality .....	75
3.4 New and emerging regulatory issues related to telecommunications services .....	77

<b>4. Audiovisual services classification</b> .....	81
4.1 Audiovisual services: The current state of affairs .....	82
4.2 Audiovisual services: Evolution of the classification negotiations .....	87
a) At the multilateral level .....	87
b) Developments in PTAs .....	90
<b>5. Methodology for classification in overlapping areas</b> .....	91
5.1 Basic methodologies in case of services with overlapping classifications .....	91
a) Introduction .....	91
b) General elements of a methodological approach .....	92
c) Assessment of existing documentations .....	94
5.2 Country case studies .....	96
a) The European Union .....	96
b) The United States .....	103
c) China .....	108
5.3 Case studies of specific issues .....	115
a) Social networks .....	115
b) Internet telephony .....	119
c) Video-on-demand .....	121
 <b>Chapter IV:</b>	
<b>Conclusions</b> .....	125
<b>1. Methodological and conceptual issues</b> .....	125
<b>2. Problems with not flexible GATS classifications</b> .....	126
<b>3. Elements of choice in making classifications decisions</b> .....	126
 <b>Appendix:</b>	
<b>Justification of trade restricting rules (Article XIV GATS)</b> .....	129
<b>A. Contents of Article XIV GATS</b> .....	129
<b>B. Public interest justifications</b> .....	130
1. Public morals and public order .....	131
2. GATS consistent laws .....	132
<b>C. General requirements</b> .....	133
1. Necessity test .....	133
2. Chapeau of Article XIV GATS .....	134



## Bibliography

- ADLUNG, RUDOLF/MORRISON, PETER, Less than the GATS: “Negative Preferences” in Regional Services Agreements, *Journal of International Economic Law* 13:4 (2010), 1–41.
- BRONCKERS, MARCO C.E.J./LAROCHE, PIERRE, The WTO Regime for Telecommunications Services, in Marco C.E.J. Bronckers/Gary N. Horlick (eds.), *WTO Jurisprudence and Policy: Practitioners’ Perspectives*, London: Cameron May, 2004, 519–590.
- BURRI, MIRA, The Law of the World Trade Organization and the Communications Law of the European Community: On a Path of Harmony or Discord?, *Journal of World Trade* 41:4 (2007), 833–878.
- BURRI, MIRA, The New Audiovisual Media Services Directive: Television without Frontiers, Television without Cultural Diversity, *Common Market Law Review* 44:6 (2007a), 1689–1725.
- BURRI, MIRA, The New Concept of Universal Service in a Digital Networked Communications Environment, *I/S: A Journal of Law and Policy for the Information Society* 3:1 (2007b), 117–146.
- BURRI, MIRA, Trade versus Culture in the Digital Environment: An Old Conflict in Need of a New Definition, *Journal of International Economic Law* 12:1 (2009), 17–62.
- BURRI, MIRA, Cultural Diversity as a Concept of Global Law: Origins, Evolution and Prospects, *Diversity* 2 (2010), 1059–1084.
- CASS, RONALD A./NOAM, ELI M., The Economics and Politics of Trade in Services: a United States Perspective, in Daniel Friedmann/Ernst-Joachim Mestmäcker (eds.), *Rules for Free International Trade in Services*, Baden-Baden: Nomos, 1990, 44–67.
- CHEN, CHUN-MEI/TSAI, HSIANG-CHIH/MAO, CHI-KUO, Income, Affordable and Threshold Effects on FMS [fixed to mobile substitution] in the Developed and Developing Economies, *Telecommunications Policy* 32:9/10 (2008), 626–641.
- COSSY, MIREILLE, Some Thoughts on the Concept of “Likeness” in the GATS, in Marion Panizzon/Nicole Pohl/Pierre Sauvé (eds.), *GATS and the Regulation of International Trade in Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, 327–357.
- COTTIER, THOMAS/MOLINUEVO, MARTIN, Article V General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 125–151.
- COTTIER, THOMAS/ DELIMATSI, PANAGIOTIS/DIEBOLD, NICOLAS F., Article XIV General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): General Exceptions, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 287–328.

- DELIMATISIS, PANAGIOTIS, *International Trade in Services and Domestic Regulations: Necessity, Transparency and Regulatory Diversity*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- DELIMATISIS, PANAGIOTIS, Article III GATS: Transparency, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008a, 92–107.
- DELIMATISIS, PANAGIOTIS, Protecting Public Morals in a Digital Age: Revisiting the WTO Rulings on *US – Gambling* and *China – Publications and Audiovisual Products*, *Journal of International Economic Law* 14:2 (2011), 1–37.
- DELIMATISIS, PANAGIOTIS, The Puzzling Interaction of Trade and Public Morals in the Digital Era, in Mira Burri/Thomas Cottier (eds.), *Trade Governance in the Digital Age*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012, 277–296.
- DELIMATISIS, PANAGIOTIS/MOLINUEVO, MARTIN, Article XIV General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): Market Access, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 367–426.
- DIEBOLD, NICOLAS F., *Non-Discrimination in International Trade in Services: Likeness in WTO/GATS*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- DODD, MOYA/JUNG, ASTRID/MITCHELL, BRIDGER/PATERSON, PAUL/REYNOLDS, PAUL, Bill-and-keep and the Economics of Interconnection in Next-Generation Networks, *Telecommunications Policy* 33:5/6 (2009), 324–337.
- FEINÄUGLE, CLEMENS, Article XXVIII General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): Scope and Definition, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 540–564.
- FINK, CARSTEN/MOLINUEVO, MARTÍN, East Asian Preferential Trade Agreements in Services: Liberalization Content and WTO Rules, *World Trade Review* 7 (2008), 641–673.
- FISHER, ALLAN G. B., Capital and the Growth of Knowledge, *Economic Journal* 43 (1933), 379–389.
- GAO HENRY, Google’s China Problem: A Case Study on Trade, Technology and Human Rights Under the GATS, *Asian Journal of WTO and International Health Law and Policy (AJWH)* 6 (2011), 347–385.
- HOEKMAN, BERNARD/MATTOO, AADITYA, Services Trade Liberalization and Regulatory Reform: Re-Invigorating International Cooperation, *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series* No 5517 (2011).
- HOFFMANN, EIVIND/CHAMIE, MARY, *Standard Statistical Classifications: Basic Principles* (1999), <http://unstats.un.org/unsd/class/family/bestprac.pdf>.
- KRAJEWSKI, MARKUS, Playing by the Rules of the Game? Specific Commitments after *US – Gambling and Betting* and the Current GATS Negotiations, *Legal Issues of Economic Integration* 32:4 (2005), 417–447.
- KRAJEWSKI, MARKUS, Article VI General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): Scope and Definition, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max*

- Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 165–196.
- KRAJEWSKI, MARKUS/ENGELKE, MAIKA, Article XVII General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): Scope and Definition, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 396–420.
- LAROCHE, PIERRE, Dealing with Convergence at the International Level, in Damien Geradin/David Luff (eds.), *The WTO and Global Convergence in Telecommunications and Audio-Visual Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004, 390–422.
- LUFF, DAVID, International Trade Law and Broadband Regulation: Towards Convergence?, *Journal of Network Industries* 3 (2002), 239–271.
- LUFF, DAVID, Current International Trade Rules Relevant to Telecommunications Services, in Damien Geradin/David Luff (eds.), *The WTO and Global Convergence in Telecommunications and Audio-Visual Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004, 34–50.
- MATHEW, BOB/JOSEPH, *The WTO Agreements on Telecommunications*, Bern: Peter Lang, 2001.
- MATTOO, AADITYA/WUNSCH-VINCENT, SACHA, Pre-Emptying Protectionism in Services: The GATS and Outsourcing, *Journal of International Economic Law* 6:4 (2004), 765–800.
- MESSERLIN, PATRICK/SIWEK, STEPHEN/COCQ, EMMANUEL, *The Audiovisual Services Sector in the GATS Negotiations*, Washington, DC: AEI Press, 2004.
- MUNIN, NELLIE, *Legal Guide to GATS*, The Hague: Kluwer Law International, 2010.
- NIHOUL, PAUL, Audio-Visual and Telecommunications Services: A Review of Definitions under WTO Law, in Damien Geradin/David Luff (eds.), *The WTO and Global Convergence in Telecommunications and Audio-Visual Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004, 357–389.
- OECD, *Remaking the Movies: Digital Content and the Evolution of the Film and Video Industries*, Paris: OECD Publishing, 2008.
- OECD, *Guide to Measuring the Information Society 2011*, Paris: OECD Publishing, 2011 available at <http://browse.oecdbookshop.org/oecd/pdfs/free/9311021e.pdf>.
- PENG SHIN-YI, Digitalization of Services, the GATS and the Protection of Personal Data, in Rolf Sethe et al. (eds.), *Kommunikation, Festschrift für Rolf H. Weber*, Bern: Stämpfli Publishing, 2011, 753–769.
- ROY, MARTIN, Audiovisual Services in the Doha Round “Dialogue de Sourds, the Sequel”?, *Journal of World Investment and Trade* 6:6 (2005), 923–952.
- ROY, MARTIN, Beyond the Main Screen: Audiovisual Services in PTAs, in Juan Marchetti/Martin Roy (eds.), *Opening Markets for Trade in Services; Countries and Sectors in WTO and Bilateral Negotiations*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, 340–377.
- ROY, MARTIN/MARCHETTI, JUAN/LIM, HOE, The Race Towards Preferential Trade Agreements in Services: How Much Market Access Is Really Achieved?, in Marion Panizzon/

- Nicole Pohl/Pierre Sauvé (eds.), *GATS and the Regulation of International Trade in Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, 77–110.
- STEINER, THOMAS, Online Games under WTO Law: Unresolved Issues, *NCCR Working Paper* 2009/3, February 2009.
- TREBILCOCK, MICHAEL J./HOWSE, ROBERT, Trade Policy and Labor Standards, *Minnesota Journal of Global Trade* 14:2 (2005), 261–300.
- TUTHILL, LEE/ SHERMAN, LAURA, Telecommunications: Can Trade Agreements Keep Up with Technology?, in Juan Marchetti/Martin Roy (eds.), *Opening Markets for Trade in Services; Countries and Sectors in WTO and Bilateral Negotiations*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, 151–183.
- TUTHILL, LEE/ROY, MARTIN, GATS Classification Issues for Information and Communication Technology Services, in Mira Burri/Thomas Cottier (eds.), *Trade Governance in the Digital Age*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012, 157–178.
- TUYËN, NGUYEN THANH, *Knowledge Economy and Sustainable Economic Development*, Berlin/New York: De Gruyter, 2010.
- VOON, TANIA, *Cultural Products and the World Trade Organization*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- WEBER, ROLF H., Information Technology Markets – Asia’s Opportunity to Revitalise the WTO, *Hong Kong Law Journal* 37 (2007), 185–228.
- WEBER, ROLF H., Cultural Diversity and International Trade – Taking Stock and Looking Ahead, in: Kern Alexander/Mads Andenas (eds.), *The World Trade Organization and Trade in Services*, Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 824–843.
- WEBER, ROLF H., Digital Trade in WTO-Law – Taking Stock and Looking Ahead, *Asian Journal of WTO and International Health Law and Policy* 5:2010, 1–24.
- WEBER ROLF H., Regulatory Autonomy and Privacy Standards under the GATS, *Asian Journal of WTO and International Health Law and Policy* 7:2012, 25–47.
- WELLENIUS, BJORN/NETO, ISABEL, Managing the Radio Spectrum: Framework for Reform in Developing Countries, *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* No 4549 (2008).
- WOLFRUM, RÜDIGER, Article II General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS): Scope and Definition, in Rüdiger Wolfrum/Peter-Tobias Stoll/Clemens Feinäugle (eds.), *Max Planck Commentaries on World Trade Law, Vol. 6: WTO – Trade in Services*, Leiden/ Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 2008, 71–91.
- WUNSCH-VINCENT, SACHA, The Digital Trade Agenda of the US: Parallel Tracks of Bilateral, Regional and Multilateral Liberalization, *Aussenwirtschaft* 1 (2003), 7–46.
- WUNSCH-VINCENT, SACHA, *The WTO, the Internet and Digital Products: EC and US Perspectives*, Oxford: Hart, 2006.
- WUNSCH-VINCENT, SACHA, Trade Rules for the Digital Age, GATS and the Regulation of International Trade in Services, in Marion Panizzon/Nicole Pohl/Pierre Sauvé (eds.), *GATS and the Regulation of International Trade in Services*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, 497–529.